

Agenda

Review Committee

February 22, 2017

A310

10:00AM-11:00AM

1. Approval of the Minutes of January 31, 2017
2. Provost's Announcements
3. Updates and reports (5-7 minutes each):
  - a. Dean Gordon Gebert – School of Architecture accreditation
  - b. Joseph Fantozzi – Enrollment update
  - c. Felix Lam – Budget snapshot
4. Questions and Discussion
5. Adjournment of the Committee of the Whole
6. Convening of Personnel Committee (11:00am)

**Review Committee Minutes**  
**February 22, 2017**  
**10:00 a.m.**

**Present:** *G. Barabino, M. Driscoll, K. Foster, G. Gebert, D. Jeruzalmi, G. Johnson, E. Koch, F. Lam, T. Liss, C. Lloyd, R. Menon, J. Mercado, G. Murphy, P. Occhiogrosso, J. Reina, D. Robinson, J. Siderakis, C. Stewart, M. R. Strzeszewski, W. Thornton, M. Trevisan, A. Undieh, L. Zinnanti, J. Alvarez (ex-officio), T. Scala (ex-officio).*  
**Excused:** *M. Baptiste, M. Brownlee, D. Cintrón, K. Ihrer, D.D. Mozeleski, K. Witherspoon*  
**Guests:** *L. Leonardo (For K. Ihrer), J. Fantozzi*

**I. Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of January 31, 2017 were approved with minor change.

**II. Provost's Announcements**

Interim Provost Driscoll commenced the meeting at 10:02 am and proceeded with her report as follows:

- **Immigration and Students:** The recent executive order provides more details about deportation of immigrants and the threshold of criminal offense which will determine if they will be asked to leave the country. Provost noted that DACA students are affected by this and we should look carefully at the public communication, even if these not related to the seven banned countries. Provost Driscoll stated that she is working with different offices in regards to the communication coming from registrar and other student services offices. She also reported that it is DACA/DREAMer student's choice to make their immigration status public, but it is our responsibility to secure Admissions and Financial Aid records for all our students regardless of their status.

Provost Driscoll reported that CUNY is getting professional advice to ensure we are informed, since rules are constantly changing. Mr. Occhiogrosso noted that laws have been tightened since 9/11 and law enforcement offices can inquire about student information. Under no circumstances are we to provide records -- all requests made via mail or by phone should be sent to Occhiogrosso's office to be addressed.

- **IG Report:** The Provost reported that the IG report is going forward. Additional documentation is pending and changes in practices are likely. She reported that the RF and 21st Century accounts will need to implement policies for the year round salaries that receive additional compensation. This will include multiple position forms throughout the year.
  - SVP Zinnanti noted that training is being provided once a month for COOs to address ethics for the use of Pcards, travel, etc.
- **Advisory Board:** The Provost with the Deans is working with the Student Disability Services Office regarding best practices and establishing an advisory council.
- **Chairs' Meeting:** There is an upcoming Chairs' meeting focusing on Tenure/Promotion and other faculty matters.

- **New Tool:** Hobsons Retain is a new system used to communicate with students using targeted lists (such as for those with outstanding tuition balance, etc.). This new system is scheduled to be implemented fall 2017. Sometime mid-March training will be conducted to allow ample time for a smooth organization.
- **Akados Virtual Bookstore:** This new online system for ordering books and materials will replace Follett. Akados, adopted by several CUNY senior colleges, will benefit students and faculty alike. It is scheduled to be fully implemented for the fall 2017 semester and whatever part of summer session can be accommodated. SVP Zinnanti is working with a team to provide training for the online order system. There is a meeting scheduled with Deans and Chairs to provide an update about the process.
- **Data:** Provost reported that data is being collected about student success initiatives and how they affect student performance and retention. The College is looking to invest in and study many efforts that have been funded over the past several years, and to examine how IR can inform the process.

### III. Updates and Reports:

#### **Architecture School: - Dean G. Gebert**

Acting Dean Gebert provided an update on the accreditation process for the Spitzer School of Architecture. He reported that three of the six programs are subject to accreditation and noted that the initial report for the current accreditation was sent in to reviewers for approval. Dean Gebert is happy to report there were only minor changes and the report was fully accepted for their visit in March. Dean Gebert explained the process which is broken down into three steps (report, accept and verify). Two of these steps have already been completed and the final step will be completed with their site visit in March over 4 days to verify what was reported.

Dean Gebert discussed that there were a few areas of concerns, these are:

- 1) Resources – Very common in this budget climate
- 2) Assessment- Documentation is weak although processes are okay
- 3) Strategic Planning for School – Current strategic is 10 years old and this is a big issue since it has been in “Draft” format for far too long without being approved by the School
- 4) Soft issues and current college investigations

Dean Gebert closed by saying that the visit is scheduled for March 11-15, 2017 and also by thanking David Robinson for all the support his office has provided the School during this process. Others in the room agreed with Dean Gebert and acknowledge Mr. Robinson for his dedication and support to the Schools/Divisions.

#### **Enrollment Management – J. Fantozzi**

Guest speaker Mr. Joseph Fantozzi reported on enrollment. Mr. Fantozzi distributed a chart showing the College’s enrollment for spring 2017 in comparison with spring 2016. Although numbers are not final, the enrollment is projected to be approximately 100 students higher than spring 2016. Graduate student retention has also been increasing, except for transfer students who have decreased across the university. (See Enrollment Headcount chart *Appendix 1*).

Discussion about enrollment verification and census reporting were discussed, it was noted that official enrollment numbers will be provided after census date. Mr. Fantozzi noted that as of

today 10% of spring 2017 enrollment has not been verified. Unfortunately because of this, it created delays for current reports and it also creates manual process for the admission's office.

Mr. Fantozzi stated that high school students, the College Now program is down by 10%. On the other hand, Study Group has been actively recruiting to reach their target by the fall 2017 semester. There are currently 8-10 students enrolled for the spring 2017.

#### **Finance and Administration: - AVP F. Lam**

AVP Lam presented the Fiscal Year 2018 State Executive/City Preliminary Budget (memo attached-*Appendix 2*). He stated that there is a potential \$250 tuition increase for FY18; however, not all the funds will be allocated to colleges. It is expected that CUNY will be taking a percentage to cover fringe benefits and other gaps. He stated that differential tuition programs will remain as is.

Mr. Lam noted that CUNY is working with McKinsey & Company to identify savings across the university. Their target is to save \$14M in their first year for an ultimate goal of \$75M. He stated this may entail more centralization and less control for the colleges, including foundations.

Mr. Lam reported on tuition collection. Our tuition target is \$88M and as of today we are half way there, aiming for a 97% collection rate, where we have been between 90-95% historically. We need to rely on a strong 2017 summer enrollment to meet our target for the current fiscal year.

Students who do not pay will be de-registered because of non-payment.

A question was asked about how soon the FY18 budget will be available; Mr. Lam responded that the budget will be available early June.

#### **IV. Questions and Discussion:**

No questions

#### **V. Adjournment of the Committee of the Whole:**

The meeting of the whole was adjourned at 11:11am

#### **VI. Personnel:**

The Committee moved to the consideration of personnel matters.

#### **VII. Adjournment of the Personnel Action Committee:**

The meeting was adjourned at 12:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Julissa Alvarez, Executive Secretary to the Review Committee

Enrollment Headcount								
	Spring 2017			Spring 2016				
	Targets	Flash	difference between Sp'17 targets and flash	Targets	Flash	Census	difference between Sp '16 flash and census	difference between Sp'16 targets and census
Freshmen	50	50	0	47	49	50	1	3
Transfers	900	932	32	971	946	938	(8)	(33)
New Grad (degree)	238	233	(5)	278	253	257	4	(21)
Undergrad Total	12,579	12,716	137	12,540	12,644	12,565	(79)	25
Grad Total	2,341	2,480	139	2,379	2,401	2,432	31	53
College Total	14,920	15,196	276	14,919	15,045	14,997	(48)	78
<i>NOTE: Numbers do not include Senior Citizens or Permits-In</i>								
J.Fantozzi 2/22/17								

## FISCAL YEAR 2018 STATE EXECUTIVE / CITY PRELIMINARY BUDGET Preliminary Analysis

### Senior College Summary

---

- The FY2018 state executive budget for the senior colleges totals \$2.46 billion, an increase of \$107.6 million, or 4.6%, over the current year.
  - The senior college increase of \$107.6 million includes:
    - \$36.2 million to fully fund projected fringe benefit cost increases.
    - \$42.8 million in revenue appropriations to accommodate a \$250 annual tuition increase to resident undergraduate tuition and proportionate increases to all other tuition categories.
    - \$35 million in tuition assistance for needy students, to be provided from revenues of University non-profit organizations.
    - The elimination of FY2017 legislative funding of \$1.5 million for the Joseph S. Murphy Institute, \$4.7 million in SEEK funds and \$250,000 for the graduate pipeline program.
- The executive plan recognizes \$253.9 million for 2016-17 retroactive collective bargaining expenses.
- The executive budget proposes the continuation of the predictable tuition policy for an additional five years. Tuition may be increased by up to \$250 and the revenue generated by the increase must be allocated for faculty, instruction, initiatives to improve student success and completion and tuition credits for TAP eligible students.

**Senior College Funding by Source (\$ millions)**

	FY2017 Adopted	FY2018 State Executive	Change (\$)	Change (%)
State Operating Support	\$1,238.5	\$1,268.3	29.8	2.4%
State Support for TAP	\$205.6	\$205.6	0.0	0.0%
<b>Total State Support</b>	<b>\$1,444.2</b>	<b>\$1,473.9</b>	<b>29.8</b>	<b>2.4%</b>
City Support	\$32.3	\$32.3	-	0.0%
Student Tuition	\$595.0	\$627.6	32.6	5.5%
Federal Funding	\$145.1	\$145.1	-	0.0%
Scholarships/Waivers	\$140.7	\$150.9	10.2	7.2%
Not-for-Profit Organizations		\$35.0	35.0	
<b>Total Senior Colleges</b>	<b>\$2,357.2</b>	<b>\$2,464.8</b>	<b>107.6</b>	<b>4.6%</b>

*Note: TAP, Federal Funding, Scholarships/Waivers amounts are based on FY2016 actuals*

## Community College Summary

---

### State Executive Budget

- The FY2018 state executive budget recommends \$252.9 million in operating aid for the community colleges, an increase of \$4.1 million from the FY2017 level.
  - Per FTE student base aid remains flat at \$2,697. Total base aid increases by \$7.7 million due to year to year actual enrollment increases and for projected increases resulting from the availability of Excelsior Scholarships.
  - FY2018 legislative funding is reduced by \$3.6 million and includes the elimination of ASAP support and a decrease in funding for child care centers and College Discovery.
- The executive budget includes a provision to reduce aid to community colleges if receipts from the federal government are less than the amounts assumed in the 2017-2018 financial plan.

### City Preliminary Budget

#### *FY 2017*

The city preliminary budget funds the following items for the current year:

- \$59.5M for PSC and DC-37 collective bargaining expenses, including ratification bonuses at the community colleges.

#### *FY 2018*

- The city preliminary budget provides \$386.2M for the community colleges, a net increase of \$20.7 million, 5.7%, over the FY2017 level.
- \$53.8M is provided for ongoing PSC and DC-37 collective bargaining expenses at the community colleges.
- The preliminary budget also includes efficiency savings of \$3.1 million.
- The net change of \$20.7 million is a result of the following:
  - Incremental increases to programs funded in prior financial plans, including \$15 million for ASAP, and increases for CUNY Math Start, CUNY Tutor Corps, College Visits Initiative, and 12<sup>th</sup> Grade Proficiency Program.
  - Adjustments to energy, fringe benefit and building rental levels to align with projected costs.
- The difference in year-to-year collective bargaining funding is due to the netting out of one time ratification bonus amounts in FY2017 and an additional amount for the annualization of salaries from FY2017 to FY2018.

**Community College Funding by Source (\$ millions)**

	FY2017 Adopted	FY2018 State Executive/ City Prelim	Change (\$)	Change (%)
State Operating Support	\$248.9	\$252.9	4.1	1.6%
State Support for TAP	\$115.5	\$115.5	-	0.0%
<b>Total State Support</b>	<b>\$364.4</b>	<b>\$368.4</b>	<b>4.1</b>	<b>1.1%</b>
City Support	\$365.5	\$386.2	20.7	5.7%
Student Tuition	\$123.6	\$123.6	-	0.0%
Federal Funding	\$116.1	\$116.1	-	0.0%
Scholarships/Waivers	\$33.6	\$33.6	-	0.0%
<b>Total Community Colleges</b>	<b>\$1,003.2</b>	<b>\$1,027.9</b>	<b>24.8</b>	<b>2.5%</b>

*Note: TAP, Federal Funding, Scholarships/Waivers amounts are based on FY2016 actuals. FY2018 City Support amount is based on the City's financial plan for FY2018.*

**City Preliminary Budget - Senior College/Other**

*FY 2017*

The City's January plan funds the following items for the current year:

- \$3.1M for the "We Are New York" adult literacy program.
- \$3.1M for John Jay College's programs with the Department of Corrections.
- A transfer of \$1M for application fee waivers from DOE to CUNY plus an additional \$150K for charter school students.
- \$265K for John Jay College's participation in assessing the outcomes of the Anti-Violence Initiative.
- \$1.17M for PSC and DC-37 collective bargaining expenses, including ratification bonuses at Hunter Campus Schools

*FY 2018*

The City's January plan funds the following items for next year:

- \$2.8M in continuing funding for John Jay College's programs with the Department of Corrections.
- \$1.15M in continuing application fee waivers.
- \$1.48M for PSC and DC-37 ongoing collective bargaining expenses at Hunter Campus Schools.



- The City's January plan does not continue funding in FY2018 for the following items:
  - \$17 million for Merit Scholarships
  - \$2M for Citizenship Now
  - \$970K for the Center for Puerto Rican Studies
  - \$970K for the Dominican Studies Institute
  - \$1.4M for the Civic Justice Corps.

---

## Financial Aid

- The state executive budget introduces the Excelsior Scholarship program to provide free tuition at CUNY and SUNY community and four year colleges to students of middle-class families earning up to \$100,000 in the current year and up to \$125,000 by FY2020. This program will be phased in over the next two years and students must be on track to complete their degrees in either 2 years for associate programs or 4 years for bachelors programs. The program is estimated to cost \$163 million annually when fully phased in.
- The executive budget includes the DREAM Act which would make undocumented students eligible for the Tuition Assistance Program and other State financial assistance programs.
- The state executive budget does not propose any changes to the Tuition Assistance Program (TAP).

---

## Other Initiatives

- The executive budget includes language that requires each CUNY affiliated nonprofit organization and foundation to provide ten percent of its prior year revenue to CUNY to fund tuition assistance initiatives.
- The state executive budget proposes to expand the oversight of the State Inspector General to include the nonprofit organizations and foundations affiliated with CUNY. The affiliates manage resources which are used on behalf of the University and therefore will be subject to review and required to adopt financial control policies.
- As a measure to control tuition costs, the executive budget bill would limit annual tuition and fee increases to either \$500 or the three-year average of the Higher Education Price Index (HEPI), whichever is greater. Starting in FY 2019, colleges and universities that exceed the tuition and fee increase threshold would disqualify newly enrolled students from receiving a Tuition Assistance Program (TAP) award.
- The executive budget states that if CUNY property is sold during FY2018, up to \$60 million of sales proceeds may be used to support senior college expenses already accrued or to accrue during the year. These sales proceeds will reduce the state's net operating expense liability.

## CAPITAL BUDGET

---

### STATE EXECUTIVE BUDGET

The FY 2018 State Executive Budget recommends \$456.6 million in new funding. The budget re-appropriates \$2.4 billion for the senior and community colleges and \$210 million for CUNY 2020, for a total of \$3.1 billion available in appropriations for CUNY in FY 2017-18.

Details of the appropriations for CUNY include:

- \$284.2 million for critical maintenance at senior colleges;
- \$80.4 million for critical maintenance projects at the community colleges, to match funding received from the City;
- The fifth-year appropriation of \$55 million for the CUNY 2020 Challenge Grant Program that will enable the University to invest in transformative capital projects that will be selected in a competitive manner based on economic impact, advancement of academic goals, innovation and collaboration. This funding is appropriated under the New York State Urban Development Corporation budget;
- \$37 million appropriated for operating expenses incurred by The Dormitory Authority of the State of New York (DASNY) and the City University Construction Fund (CUCF) while overseeing construction activities for CUNY's facilities; includes \$21 million for DASNY and \$16 million for CUCF;
- \$2.6 billion in re-appropriations consisting of:
  - \$2.1 billion re-appropriated for senior colleges;
  - \$310.0 million re-appropriated for community colleges and Medgar Evers College;
  - \$210.0 million re-appropriated for CUNY 2020 Challenge Grant Program.

The State continues the following initiatives in the out years of the financial plan:

- Senior college critical maintenance funding continues at \$284 million a year;
- Community college critical maintenance funding continues at \$10 million a year;
- Funding for CUNY 2020 Challenge Grant Program continues at \$55 million a year, extended for another 5 years;
- Recurring funding for operating expenses incurred by DASNY and CUCF for overseeing the design, construction, acquisition, reconstruction, rehabilitation and improvement of CUNY's facilities.
- Language allowing design-build procurement was added for the new critical maintenance funds appropriated for FY17-18.



## **CITY JANUARY PLAN**

The City provided an additional \$1.5M towards space renovations for ASAP. This is in addition to the \$7M already received.

## Tables and Figures

### University-wide Funding by Source (\$ millions)

	FY2017 Adopted	FY2018 State Executive/City Prelim	Change from base \$	Change from base %
<b>Senior Colleges</b>				
State Operating Support	\$1,238.5	\$1,268.3	\$29.8	2.4%
State Support for TAP	\$205.6	\$205.6	\$0.0	0.0%
<b>Total State Support</b>	<b>\$1,444.2</b>	<b>\$1,473.9</b>	<b>\$29.8</b>	<b>2.1%</b>
City Support	\$32.3	\$32.3	\$0.0	0.0%
Student Tuition	\$595.0	\$627.6	\$32.6	5.5%
Federal	\$145.1	\$145.1	\$0.0	0.0%
Scholarships/Waivers	\$140.7	\$150.9	\$10.2	7.2%
Not-For-Profit Organizations	\$0.0	\$35.0	\$35.0	
<b>Total Senior Colleges<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>\$2,357.2</b>	<b>\$2,464.8</b>	<b>\$107.6</b>	<b>4.6%</b>
<b>Community Colleges</b>				
State Operating Support	\$248.9	\$252.9	\$4.1	1.6%
State Support for TAP	\$115.5	\$115.5	\$0.0	0.0%
<b>Total State Support</b>	<b>\$364.4</b>	<b>\$368.4</b>	<b>\$4.1</b>	<b>1.1%</b>
City Support	\$365.5	\$386.2	\$20.7	5.7%
Student Tuition	\$123.6	\$123.6	\$0.0	0.0%
Federal	\$116.1	\$116.1	\$0.0	0.0%
Scholarships/Waivers	\$33.6	\$33.6	\$0.0	0.0%
<b>Total Community Colleges</b>	<b>\$1,003.2</b>	<b>\$1,027.9</b>	<b>\$24.8</b>	<b>2.5%</b>
<b>University-wide</b>				
State Operating Support	\$1,487.4	\$1,521.3	\$33.9	2.3%
State Support for TAP	\$321.1	\$321.1	\$0.0	0.0%
<b>Total State Support</b>	<b>\$1,808.5</b>	<b>\$1,842.4</b>	<b>\$33.9</b>	<b>1.9%</b>
City Support	\$397.8	\$418.5	\$20.7	5.2%
Student Tuition	\$718.6	\$751.2	\$32.6	4.5%
Federal	\$261.2	\$261.2	\$0.0	0.0%
Scholarships/Waivers	\$174.3	\$184.5	\$10.2	5.9%
Not-For-Profit Organizations	\$0.0	\$35.0	\$35.0	
<b>Total University</b>	<b>\$3,360.3</b>	<b>\$3,492.7</b>	<b>\$132.4</b>	<b>3.9%</b>

<sup>1</sup> Excludes Income Fund Reimbursables

Note: TAP, Federal Funding, Scholarships/Waivers amounts are based on FY2016 actuals



**FY2018 State Executive Budget  
Senior Colleges and University-wide Programs (\$000)**

	FY2017 State Adopted Budget	FY2018 Executive Budget	Change (\$)
<b>Senior Colleges</b>	<b>1,436,357</b>	<b>1,477,657</b>	<b>41,300</b>
<b>Academic Excellence</b>	<b>3,070</b>	<b>3,070</b>	<b>-</b>
Language Immersion Programs	1,070	1,070	-
Nursing Programs	2,000	2,000	-
PSC Research Awards	3,309	3,309	-
<b>Student Services</b>	<b>44,461</b>	<b>74,531</b>	<b>30,070</b>
Child Care	1,430	1,430	-
City University Supplemental Tuition Assistance (CUSTA)	1,060	1,060	-
Graduate Pipeline Program	250	0	(250)
SEEK Program	28,077	23,397	(4,680)
CUNY LEADS	1,500	1,500	-
Financial Aid Matching Funds	1,444	1,444	-
Student Services	1,700	1,700	-
Tuition Reimbursement	9,000	9,000	-
Tuition Assistance Initiatives		35,000	35,000
<b>University Management/Infrastructure</b>	<b>869,993</b>	<b>906,193</b>	<b>36,200</b>
Building Rentals	52,842	52,842	-
Central Administration	36,300	36,300	-
Fringe Benefits	690,055	726,255	36,200
Information Management Systems	12,167	12,167	-
Utilities	78,628	78,628	-
<b>Total Programs</b>	<b>920,833</b>	<b>987,103</b>	<b>66,270</b>
<b>Total Operating Budget</b>	<b>2,357,190</b>	<b>2,464,760</b>	<b>107,570</b>



**FY2018 State Executive Budget  
Community College State Aid (\$ 000)**

	2017 Adopted Budget	2018 Executive Budget	Change (\$)
<b>Base Aid</b>	<b>226,963</b>	<b>234,676</b>	<b>7,713</b>
<b>Program and Initiatives</b>			
ASAP	2,500	-	(2,500)
Building Rentals	8,948	8,948	-
Child Care	1,715	813	(902)
College Discovery	1,349	1,124	(225)
Apprentice CUNY program	2,000	2,000	-
Community Schools Grants	1,500	1,500	-
Economic Development	1,880	1,880	-
Next Generation Job Linkage	2,000	2,000	-
<b>Total Programs and Initiatives</b>	<b>21,892</b>	<b>18,265</b>	<b>(3,627)</b>
<b>Total Community College State Aid</b>	<b>248,855</b>	<b>252,941</b>	<b>4,086</b>